

Open Research Online

The Open University's repository of research publications and other research outputs

The activation of the image: expatriate carvers and kneeling effigies in late Gothic Spain

Journal Item

How to cite:

Woods, Kim (2017). The activation of the image: expatriate carvers and kneeling effigies in late Gothic Spain. *The Sculpture Journal*, 26(1) pp. 11–24.

For guidance on citations see [FAQs](#).

© [not recorded]



<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

Version: Accepted Manuscript

Link(s) to article on publisher's website:
<http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.3828/sj.2017.26.1.3>

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data [policy](#) on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk

The activation of the image: expatriate carvers and kneeling effigies in late Gothic Spain

In his famous book on tomb sculpture, first published in 1964, Panofsky suggests that the kneeling effigies so distinctive of 16th century Spain began with the lost tomb of Charles VIII (d.1498) by the Italian sculptor Guido Mazzoni and formerly in Saint-Denis.¹ In fact this progressive format was not an Italian one but one that had been introduced into the Iberian peninsula over 50 years earlier, almost certainly by the Netherlandish émigré sculptors and brothers Master Hanequin and Master Egas Cueman (Coman/Cuyman) of Toledo but originally from Brussels.² The purpose of this paper is to explore how these effigies might have functioned and what might have inspired them.

The best known of the Cueman kneeling tombs is the stone tomb of Alonso de Velasco (d.1477) and his wife Isabel de Cuadros in the remote pilgrimage church of Guadalupe. This documented tomb was commissioned in 1467 from Master Egas Cueman (d.1495). It shows the two donors as if alive, praying in a private side chapel with a privileged view onto the adjacent high altar (fig.1).³ The tomb is set to the left of the altar in the corner of an independent chapel adjoining the pilgrimage church just to the right of the entrance (fig.2). Behind the Velasco couple is a simulated doorway with two pages, diminished in scale as if set at a distance, appearing as if to attend the kneeling donors. They carry swords that Alonso as a knight should by rights carry but does not. The illusion of space and narrative is sophisticated.

After some extraordinary detailing about the clothing of the two statues, the contract specifies that they are to kneel with open books 'as if they were reciting from the said books with their hands together'.⁴ The verb used here, *rezar*, has several meanings including to pray, recite or say, but clearly suggests active devotional participation. These are not passive images but lively and performative ones, dressed like real people and creating a sense of active involvement in the liturgies within the chapel.⁵ Each book was apparently placed on an adjacent prie dieu which, although now lost, were definitely made for they are mentioned in the

¹ Erwin Panofsky, *Tomb Sculpture: its Changing Aspects from Ancient Egypt to Bernini*, London, Phaidon Press, 1992, pp.76-81.

² For the kneeling pose and Master Egas see Joaquín Yarza Luaces, 'La imagen del rey y la imagen del noble en el siglo XV castellano' in *Realidad e Imágenes del Poder: España a Fines de la Edad Media*, ed. Adeline Rucquoi, Valladolid, Ambito Ediciones, 1988, pp.267-291 (285); and David Chao Castro, 'La imagen orante de Pedro I: la importación de un modelo transpirenaico', in Concepción Cosmen Alonso et al (eds) *El Intercambio artístico entre los reinos hispanos y las cortes Europeas en la Baja Edad Media*, Leon, Universidad de Leon, 2009, pp.103-126.

³ This point is also made in María Teresa Pérez Higuera, 'La escultura', in Joan Sureda Pons (ed), *La España Gotica: Castilla-la Mancha, Cuenca, Ciudad Real y Albacete*, Madrid, Ediciones Encuentro, 1997, pp. 39-48 (p.46).

⁴ [sic] 'los bultos han de estar de tal continencia conmo si esoviesen resando por los dichos libros con las manos juntas', Germán Rubio & Isidoro Acemel, 'El maestro Egas en Guadalupe', *Boletín de la Sociedad Española de Excursiones*, XX, 1912, pp.192-229 (207).

⁵ This point is also made by Teresa Pérez Higuera, 'El foco Toledano y su entorno', in Joaquín Yarza Luaces & Alberto C. Ibáñez Pérez (eds) *Actas del Congreso Internacional sobre Gil de Siloe y la Escultura de su Época*, Burgos, Caja de Burgos, 2001, pp.263-286 (269).

polychromy contract after Velasco's death. Enhanced by colour and simulated fabric, wood and flesh, this painted stone ensemble would have looked startlingly lifelike. Those glancing into the chapel as they entered the main church may almost have mistaken them for living people. These are not effigies of the dead so much as surrogates of the living.

A drawing of uncertain date of a recumbent secular male effigy survives signed by Egas Cueman and a scribe, and is apparently the first plan of patron and sculptor.⁶ Although the wall niche is very broadly similar in both drawing and finished tomb, the effigy is deeply conservative compared with the radical final solution. A recumbent effigy would have been scarcely visible to pilgrims entering the church, whereas the kneeling effigies have both immediacy and visibility. As the tomb was commissioned during Velasco's lifetime it was supposed to have served a purpose however briefly during their lives as well as after. This in fact did not happen, for when Velasco made his will in 1476 the tomb was still unfinished and it was his widow who supervised its polychromy.

The tomb at Guadalupe associates the kneeling format firmly with Master Egas, but the change of design here should not be taken as an indication that it was at Guadalupe that the kneeling tomb was pioneered, for there are at least two earlier examples that were more daring still. They were not wall tombs but freestanding kneeling effigies before the high altar.

The life-size kneeling effigy of Bishop of Cuenca Lope de Barrientos (1382-1469) was certainly in existence by the time he made his will in 1454, when he requested that his body be buried below the alabaster effigy he had ordered to be made (fig.3).⁷ He went on to live for another 15 years so the tomb served a long purpose during his life as well as after his death. His effigy and grave were originally in the hospital of Nuestra Señora de la Piedad which Barrientos had founded 1447-1451 in Medina del Campo. The hospital itself is lost but Barrientos's will and old histories of Medina del Campo show that the effigy was originally placed on a tombstone in the middle of the choir or capilla mayor of the hospital church, hence in the position traditionally reserved for the major donor or patron, before the high altar.⁸ The chapel had a

⁶ Most recently discussed in Lorne Campbell ed., *Rogier van der Weyden and the Kingdoms of the Iberian Peninsula*, Madrid, Museo Nacional del Prado, 2015, pp.160-165; see also Rubio & Acemel, as at note 4; Beatrice Gilman Proske, *Castilian sculpture: Gothic to Renaissance*, New York, Hispanic Society of America, 1951, pp. 118, 126; Harold Edwin Wethey, 'Anequín Cueman. A Fleming in Spain', *Art Bulletin*, 19, 1937, pp.381-401 (though aspects of this article are incorrect).

⁷ Speaking of 'nuestro cuerpo miserable' he stipulated 'e lo pongan debaxo del vulto de alabastro segund e por la vía que lo nos tenemos fecho e ordenado en medio de la dicha nuestra capilla'; Angel Martínez Casado, *Lope de Barrientos: un Intellectual de la Corte de Juan II*, Salamanca, Editorial San Esteban, 1994, p.257; for complete will see pp.254-271; see also pp.85-91; 103-4. See also Paloma Cuenca Muñoz, 'El legado testamentario de Lope de Barrientos', *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma, ser.III, Historia Medieval*, 9, 1996, pp.303-326, available online at :

<http://e-spacio.uned.es/fez/eserv.php?pid=bibliuned:ETF8D397EE8-3EA2-C2E6-BDB2-C774CF539638&dsID=Documento.pdf>

⁸ Ildefonso Rodríguez y Fernández, *Historia de la muy Noble, Leal y Coronada Villa de Medina del Campo Conforme a Varios Documentos y Notas a ella Pertinentes*, Madrid, Imprenta de San Francisco de Sales, 1903-4, pp.456-457.

mudejar-style coffered ceiling decorated with Arabic-style stars, and an inscription ran round it naming Barrientos and his relatives.

His unusual kneeling image is fashioned of no fewer than 28 pieces of polychromed alabaster.⁹ Unusually, he is accompanied not by a page but by a small dog hanging his head perhaps to suggest sorrow. Whether the dog was originally designed to be beside him as it is currently exhibited is unclear. If the narrow end of the rectangular tombstone was oriented towards the altar as was customary then the dog could have been placed behind the effigy, as Jean Jouvenel's wife was placed behind her husband in Saint-Denis, as we will see.¹⁰ A dog, of course, is frequently placed at an effigy's feet as a symbol of fidelity, which may be the connotation here, though it is also possible that it is a play on Barrientos's status as a Dominican ('domini canes' means 'dogs of the Lord'). Dogs visualising the Dominicans are included in the tympanum of the entrance of Santa Cruz el Real, Segovia, though allied to the militant agenda of its prior Torquemada, an admittedly different character from Barrientos.¹¹ Like the kneeling effigy of Velasco, this lifelike figure constituted a performative substitute for Lope during his lifetime. After his death it supplied a surrogate presence in perpetuity. Because this effigy is free-standing it places Barrientos in the midst of those officiating in the ceremonies of the chapel. The apparent absence of a desk with a book – though it is conceivable that he originally had one – increases his sense of involvement. He continues to maintain an active presence in the church he had founded long after death.

The constitutions of the hospital reveal a little more about how the tomb may have functioned in its original space. Regulations on burial stipulate that noble inmates of the hospital might be buried in the main part of the church up to the reja dividing it from the Capilla Mayor where Barrientos was buried but, by implication, not within the Capilla itself.¹² This suggests that his kneeling effigy would have been viewed through this presumably metal screen and almost certainly in splendid isolation. Barrientos's own relatives were buried in the family chapel in the neighbouring monastery of Sant' Andres, and there is no suggestion that there were other tombs within the Capilla Mayor. Secondly, the constitutions reveal that a theologian was to be employed in the Capilla Mayor between January and September to teach whoever might wish to learn.¹³ The kneeling effigy of Barrientos would have formed a surrogate presence at these sermons or lectures, a reminder of who had endowed them and a watchful presence overseeing their conscientious delivery. The Latin

⁹ 150cm high; see Campbell as in note 6, pp.166-172; Clementina Julia Ara Gil, *Escultura Gótica en Valladolid y su Provincia*, Valladolid, Publicaciones de la Excma, Disputación Provincial de Valladolid, Institución cultural Simancas, 1977, pp. 213-217.

¹⁰ The effigy was later moved to a wall niche in the presbytery and old photographs suggest that by then the dog was no longer displayed with it. See José Martí y Monsó, *Estudios Histórico-Artísticos Relativos Principalmente a Valladolid*, 2 vols, Valladolid & Madrid, Leonardo Miñón, 1898-1901, vol.I, p.305.

¹¹ Eduardo Carrero Santamaría, 'Patrocinio regio e inquisición. El programa iconográfico de la Cueva de Santo Domingo' in Yarza Luaces & Ibáñez Pérez as in note 5, pp.447-462 (457).

¹² Eugenio Fontaneda Pérez, 'El hospital de la Piedad y San Antonio Abad o del Obispo Barrientos', in *Historia de Medina del Campo y su tierra* vol.1, ed. Eufemio Lorenzo Sanz, Medina del Campo, Ayuntamiento Medino del Campo, 1986, pp.429-450 (p.446, constitution 5); this is taken from the 1602 Spanish translation of the constitutions, originally written in Latin in 1447 (p.442).

¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 449, constitution 9.

inscription IHS on Barrientos's left glove and the Greek inscription XPS on the right remind a close observer of his own considerable scholarly credentials.

Barrientos is represented in rich, festive vestments, with a pearl-encrusted mitre and a blue and gold outer robe painted using the most precious of pigments which were also his heraldic colours, as the coat of arms on the back reveals. Here the surfaces are almost miraculously detailed, such as the enormous morse decorated with two angels holding a coat of arms and Barrientos's bishop's hat.¹⁴ In the borders of the chasuble are reliefs of angels holding instruments of the Passion, apt on the one hand for a festive mass and on the other for Barrientos's own concerns for personal salvation. With its portrait-like, lined features, furrowed brow and pensive expression the face of Barrientos is significantly more nuanced than the bland, staring face of Velasco at Guadalupe. The more precious and lustrous material, alabaster, in itself differentiates this kneeling tomb significantly from that of the Velascos, which depended upon the polychromy to enhance the plain stone. In concept, facture and materials this kneeling effigy trumps the later Velasco tomb in every way.

Like the Velasco tomb, the Barrientos effigy is firmly associated with the Cueman brothers. Barrientos's will reveals that he had been charged to oversee the making of a pair or group of tombs (the number is not specified) by a deceased woman called Urraca Gonçalves de Contreras in Avila, where Barrientos had been bishop 1441-4.¹⁵ In turn, Barrientos made provision for the completion of this work and the payment of its sculptor Master Hanequin of Toledo (d. by 1475). Barrientos evidently knew the prestigious Master Hanequin, Master of works at Toledo Cathedral by 1442, from the tombs of Urraca Gonçalves de Contreras. It was also the Cueman brothers who were commissioned to make the choir stalls at Cuenca Cathedral where Barrientos was bishop in 1454.¹⁶ It makes sense to suppose that he would have chosen Hanequin to make his own tomb as well.¹⁷ Indeed it is conceivable that it was partly because of Barrientos's intervening commissions that Urraca's tombs were still incomplete.

Hanequin's brother Egas is first documented in connection with the Cuenca stalls in 1454, 12 years after Hanequin himself. This, together with the 20 years separating their death dates (by 1475; 1495), suggests that Hanequin may have been quite a bit older and in the 1450s certainly the more eminent. If Egas was already making tombs by this time then it was evidently in his brother's name. Barrientos's will suggests, however, that during the 1450s Hanequin might have been doing some hands-on sculpture himself alongside directing the cathedral works at Toledo. It

¹⁴ The hat resembles that of a cardinal's but has tassels appropriate to bishop status.

¹⁵ Martínez Casado as in note 7, p.269.

¹⁶ María González Sanchez-Gabriel, 'Los hermanos Egas, de Bruselas, en Cuenca: la sillería de coro de la colegiata de Belmonte', *Boletín del Seminario de Estudios de Arte y Arqueología*, 12, 1936, pp.21-34.

¹⁷ Amalia María Yuste Galán, 'La introducción del arte flamenco en Castilla: Pedro Jalopa, Maestro de los Luna', *Archivo Español*, LXXVII/307, 2004, pp.291-300 (295).

should not automatically be assumed that he abandoned sculpture entirely because of the pressures of his duties at Toledo. His counterpart at the Cathedral of Leon, Master Jusquin, was Master of Works between 1445 and 1481 and from 1460 was expected to produce an image a year alongside his other responsibilities.¹⁸

The inspiration for Barrientos's tomb was almost certainly a third kneeling effigy (fig.4) that has also been associated with the Cueman brothers, that of Pedro I (reg.1350-1369) from the now demolished Dominican convent of Santo Domingo el Real, Madrid.¹⁹ It was made at the request of his granddaughter Constanza of Castile (d.1478), prioress between 1416 and 1465. In 1444 the capilla mayor of the priory church was re-founded as Pedro's funeral chapel and his remains were transferred there from Extremadura two years later. The image was originally placed, like that of Barrientos, in front of the altar though it was moved in 1612.²⁰ Given the high profile of this reburial there seems no good reason to date the effigy much after 1446; either it predated that of Barrientos or the two were made around the same time. As a senior Dominican, Barrientos had strong connections with Santo Domingo. It was he who confirmed the monastery's liberties, for example.²¹ He must have known about the re-interment of Pedro I and would surely have been familiar with Pedro's kneeling effigy as well.

It had been assumed that the effigy of Pedro I was originally a recumbent effigy that had been reconfigured into a kneeling position in the sixteenth century.²² In an important article of 2009 to which this paper is much indebted, Chao Castro proved conclusively that this was not correct. He pointed out that chronicler Antoine Lalaing noted the kneeling posture of this effigy in 1501 when he accompanied Philip the Handsome of the Netherlands on his first visit to Spain.²³

Chao Castro connected the kneeling effigy of Pedro with the concept of perpetual prayer before the altar and this is surely correct, but there is more to be said here.²⁴ Pedro is represented with his eyes open and his lips slightly parted, as if saying his prayers – or the liturgical responses – out loud. Oddly, this unusual feature has been ignored and even corrected – the mid-19th century engraving made for Carderero y Solano showed Pedro more conventionally, but quite inaccurately, with mouth

¹⁸ Juan Luis Blanco Mozo, 'Maestro Jusquin escultor. Nuevas aportaciones, nuevos problemas', in Yarza Luaces & Ibáñez Pérez as at note 5, pp.463-473 (465).

¹⁹ For this chapel and the tombs see David Nogales Rincón, *La Representación Religiosa de la Monarquía Castellano-Leonesa: la Capilla Real 1252-1504*, unpublished doctoral thesis Universidad Complutense, Madrid, 2009, pp.1477-1577; María del Pilar Rábade Obrado, 'Religiosidad y Memoria Política: la Constituciones de la Capilla de Pedro I en Santo Domingo el Real de Madrid (1464)', *En la España Medieval*, 26, 2003, pp.227-261; Chao Castro, as at note 2.

²⁰ Nogales Rincón as in note 18, p.1490, n.73.

²¹ Luis G.Alonso Getino, 'Vida y obras de Fr Lope de Barrientos', *Anales Salamantinos*, I, 1927, xxxv, lxxiii.

²² Angela Franco Mata, *Catálogo de la Escultura Gotica, Museo Arqueologico Nacional*, Madrid, Museo Arqueologico, 1993, pp.119-121.

²³ Chao Castro as at note 2, p.108; Louis Prosper Gachard ed., *Collection des Voyages des Souverains des Pays-Bas*, 4 vols (Brussels, 1876), vol.1, p.173.

²⁴ Chao Castro draws on the concept of perpetual prayer in L.Bruhns, 'Das Motiv der Ewigen Anbetung in der Römischen Grabplastik des 16, 17 und 18 Jahrhunderts', *Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte*, IV, 1940, pp.253-426.

closed.²⁵ Here the performative implications of the Barrientos and Velasco effigies are made absolutely clear. Pedro is participating in perpetuity, not in private prayer but in public worship, alongside the faithful within the Capilla Real and presumably at least partially visible from elsewhere in the church. Pedro was known as 'the Cruel', and as Enrique II's ousted and murdered rival, his reputation was dismal. It is difficult not to see an element of rehabilitation in this ultra-pious statue, but there is more still.

The 1464 constitutions of this Dominican convent were researched before the kneeling format of Pedro's effigy was generally accepted, and as a result one key stipulation passed with little comment.²⁶ The statue was to be uncovered at Easter and at other times decided by the prioress or chaplains; it was then to be covered up again.²⁷ This might not have seemed particularly startling for a conventional recumbent tomb, though it reverses the usual procedure for draping a tomb with rich cloths at anniversaries and select festivities. Once it is clear that the effigy was kneeling this ritual becomes a highly melodramatic one of revealing and concealing, rather daringly reminiscent of the unveiling of sacred statues after Lent.

In the late Middle Ages rulers often worshipped privately in portable oratories set up for their use in the choir of public or monastic churches, a practice derived from the kings of France and adopted in Mallorca and in Castile by Juan II at least by 1453.²⁸ The oratory curtains might be closed or opened to varying degrees at different points of the liturgy, either concealing, or partially or fully revealing the rule, and hence emphasizing either his sacred or his human majesty. The curtains themselves might also vary according to the liturgical calendar, like vestments.²⁹ Barrientos's presence at the court of Juan II, suggests that he would have witnessed and been familiar with this growing practice. The process of revealing and concealing of the kneeling effigy specified in the constitutions indicates a very similar practice, and raises the possibility that it might have been something resembling a portable oratory that habitually covered this figure.

This is a performative statue, and ritual, intended to present Pedro as if alive rather than dead, and activated rather than inert. The lustre of the alabaster would have enhanced its lifelike qualities, particularly when illuminated as on the Feast of All Saints, when candles were burned to either side of it.³⁰ The radical conception, the staring expression, and the intricate surface decoration, imitating blue and gold

²⁵ Valentin Carderera y Solano, *Iconografía Española ; Colección de Retratos, Estatuas, Mausoleos y demás Monumentos Inéditos de Reyes, Reinas, Grandes Capitanes, Escritores etc desde el siglo XI hasta el XVII*, 2 vols, Madrid, 1855-1864, vol I, pl.XXVI.

²⁶ See Pilar Rábade Obrado as at note 18.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, pp.237, 253: '...e descubrir el vulto por las pascuas, cada e quando le fuere mandado por la senora priora o por los capellanes, e de le tornar a cobrir pasada la fiesta o pascua..'.
²⁸ Jorge Fernández-Santos Ortiz-Iribas, 'Ostensio Regis: la 'Real Cortina' como espacio y manifestación del poder soberano de los Austrias españoles', *Potestas : Religión, poder y monarquía. Revista del Grupo Europeo de Investigación Histórica*, 4, 2011, pp.167-210, especially 176-79, 193-4. I am extremely grateful to Werner Thomas for pointing me towards this article and for suggesting to me the parallels with royal ceremonial.

²⁹ Bernadette Nelson, 'Ritual and ceremony in the Spanish Royal chapel, c.1559-1561', *Early Music History*, 19, 2000, pp.105-200, especially 130, 166. Thanks to Werner Thomas for alerting me to this article.

³⁰ Rábade Obrado as at note 18, pp.242, 251.

brocade, are clearly reminiscent of the Cueman brothers, to whom this extraordinary effigy is usually attributed on the basis of comparisons with the Velasco tomb of Guadalupe.

A fourth, albeit short-lived kneeling effigy has also been associated with Master Hanequin. The completion of the northern gothic chapel of Alvaro de Luna (d.1453) in Toledo Cathedral has plausibly been connected with Hanequin after 1435.³¹ Legend has it that within this chapel were lavish, gilded brass effigies of Alvaro de Luna and his wife, made during their lifetime and reputed to have been capable of being hauled up into a kneeling position.³² They were quickly destroyed in 1441, long before the death of those they represented. Barrientos had been a supporter of Alvaro de Luna, indeed the money Alvaro had set aside for his own chapel was reallocated to Barrientos's hospital church by Juan II.³³ He constitutes a link between the various kneeling effigies, but so also do their makers, the Cueman brothers. Where did the idea originate, to activate an inert, recumbent effigy into a performative, kneeling effigy?

There is little indication that a convention of kneeling tombs existed in the brothers' home town of Brussels, or elsewhere in the Low Countries. A miniature in a Netherlandish book of hours dating from the 1480s shows a skeleton kneeling on top of a tomb slab, with an inscription running around it.³⁴ This ironic and moralising take on the Barrientos tomb type suggests that it was known at least by this date, but there is nothing to suggest such tombs actually existed earlier, and hence could have constituted part of the Cuemans' cultural experience. In Tewkesbury Abbey in England, a kneeling stone effigy of Edward Despenser (d.1375) was placed on top of his chantry chapel gazing down at the altar and far removed from his bones

³¹ Guido Conrad von Konradsheim, 'Hanequin Coeman de Bruxelles, introducteur de l'art flamand au XVe siècle dans la région Tolédane', *Mélanges de la Casa Velasquez*, 12, 1976, pp.127-140 (133). See also entry by José María Azcárate Ristori in the Grove Dictionary of Art at

<http://www.oxfordartonline.com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/subscriber/article/grove/art/T036487?q=hanequin&search=quick&pos=1&start=1#firsthit> accessed 08/01/2014. For Alvaro de Luna see Patrick Lenaghan, 'Commemorating a real bastard: the chapel of Alvaro de Luna', in Elisabeth Valdez del Alamo (ed.), *Memory and the Medieval Tomb*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, pp.129-151 (p.130 and note 21) and Judith Ostermann, 'Aufstieg, Fall und politisches Erbe: Alvaro de Lunas im Spiegel seines Grabmals', in *Das Grabmal des Günstlings: Studiend zur Memorialkultur frühneuzeitlicher Favoriten* ed Arne Karsen, Humboldt Schriften zur Kunst und Bildgeschichte, Berlin, Mann Verlag, 2011), pp.253-380 (261).

³² For earliest account of this lost statue see Pedro de Alcacer, *Hystoria o descripcion dela imperial cibdad de Toledo con todas las cosas acontedidas en ella desde su principio y fundación*, originally published Toledo 1554; facsimile Madrid, Ed. Instituto Provincial de Investigación y Estudios Toledanos, 1973, Book 1, chapter XCIV, fol.lxxix verso: ... 'dos bultos ricos y sumptuosos ... encima[]de las sepulturas desdicho maestre y Condestably, y de su muger, que en su vida hizo hazer de laton dorado de muy rica y subtil obra, hechos por[]tal arte, q[ue] los podia[n] hazer leva[n]tar y poner de rodillas, cada vez que querían...' [two rich and sumptuous figures...at the graves of the said master and Constable and his wife, which he had made during his lifetime of gilded bronze of very rich and subtle artifice, made with such ingenuity that it was possible to lift them onto their knees every time they wanted]. See also *Laberinto de Fortuna/ Juan de Mena*, ed.Maximiliaan Kerkof, Madrid, Castalia, 1995, pp.245-6.

³³ Martínez Casado, as at note 7, doc 26, pp.245-251.

³⁴ James Marrow, 'Symbolism and meaning in North European art of the later Middle Ages and the early Renaissance', *Simiolus*, 16 2/3, 1986, pp.150-169 (p.162, fig.17).

underneath the pavement of the chapel below.³⁵ More pertinently, a genre of kneeling effigies did exist in France dating back to the fourteenth century. Several examples may be found among the so-called Gaignières tomb drawings made in the eighteenth century, before the widespread destruction of tombs during the French Revolution. For example kneeling effigies of Jean de Brie (d.1356) and Jeanne de Dreux were formerly in the Abbey of St Georges sur Loire, along with various other members of the Brie family.³⁶ Also among the Gaignières drawings is the kneeling figure commemorating Master Mason Jean Ravy, dated to 1351 and formerly placed in Notre Dame, Paris, against the cloister wall he had helped to design and build c.1318-1344.³⁷ To Ravy himself is attributed the kneeling figure of Canon Pierre du Fayel (d.1344), also formerly in the cloister and now in the Louvre.³⁸ According to the inscription, Fayel contributed to the costs of the cloister; his image, like that of Ravy, might be viewed as much as a commemorative donor or votive figure as an effigy, particularly as it is less than life size.

The restored kneeling stone effigies of Jean Jouvenel des Ursins I (d.1431) and Michelle de Vitry (d.1456) are all that survive from their tomb in the family chapel of Saint-Rémi, Notre Dame, Paris (fig.5). This was definitely a tomb, and it was free-standing, like those of Pedro I and Barrientos. These figures date from around the same time as that of Pedro I, not long after 1441, when Michèle and her son Jean, then Bishop of Beauvais, began to negotiate with the chapter of Notre Dame, Paris, to adopt and furnish the chapel of Saint-Rémi as the family burial chapel, including the tomb.³⁹ The eighteenth century Gaignières drawing (fig.6) shows that Jean I and Michèle were originally placed one behind the other facing the altar, and raised up on a tomb chest decorated with coats of arms.⁴⁰ It is possible that Barrientos's tomb originally looked rather like this. Like the Velasco tomb, the couple have desks with books open in front of them and, like the Spanish effigies, are actively involved in the liturgy. The tomb was formerly accompanied by a painting of Jouvenel, Michele and their eleven children, which survives in the Musée National du Moyen Age, and bears witness to the social aspirations of the family.⁴¹

Jean I had been provost of the merchants of Paris and councillor to Charles VI, and the chapel of Saint-Rémi was reputedly granted to him and his family by the chapter

³⁵ Phillip Lindley, 'The later medieval monuments and chantry chapels' in Richard Keith Morris & Ron Shoesmith (eds) *Tewkesbury Abbey, history art and architecture*, Almeley, Logaston, 2003, pp.161-182 (169-171).

³⁶ Jean Adhémar, 'Les tombeaux de la collection Gaignières, dessins d'archéologie du XVIIe siècle', *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 84, 1974/2, pp.1-192 (nos 805, 1330-1333).

³⁷ Françoise Autrand et al, *La France et les Arts en 1400: les princes des fleurs de lis*, Paris, Réunion des musées nationaux, 2004, p.84.

³⁸ Michèle Beaulieu & Victor Beyer, *Dictionnaire des sculpteurs français du Moyen Âge*, Paris, Picard, 1992, pp.84-86.

³⁹ Craig Wright, *Music and ceremony at Notre Dame of Paris 500-1550*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1989, p.13; Pierre Louis Péchenard, *Jean Juvénal des Ursins : étude sur sa vie et ses œuvres*, Paris, Ernest Thorin, 1876, pp.86-87 ;

⁴⁰ Jean Adhémar, 'Les tombeaux de la collection Gaignières, dessins d'archéologie du XVIIe siècle', *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 88/II (1976), pp1-128 (15, no.1160). There are other drawings in the Gaignières collection that show kneeling effigies, but he recorded only their death date, not the date that the tombs were made.

⁴¹ Jennifer E. Courts, 'Weaving legitimacy: the Jouvenel des Ursins family and the construction of nobility in fifteenth-century France', in Kate Dimitrova & Margaret Goehring (eds), *Dressing the Part: Textiles as Propaganda in the Middle Ages*, Turnhout, Brepols, 2014, pp.141-152.

because of his service to king and realm. Placed in the ambulatory, the chapel and its tomb had geographical status, but also ritual status, for it was at the Feast of Saint-Remi that winter liturgical hours began, with Mass at 9 am rather than 8 am.⁴² From the beginning, daily masses were specified for the chapel and after these the chantry priest recited the *De Profundis* over the tomb; the family added a monthly requiem mass (1469) and processions from the nave to the chapel after the obits of Jean I and Michelle (1481).⁴³ Like Pedro I, the effigy of Jean Jouvenel might have offered the illusion of surrogate participation. His tomb anticipates by some decades the lost kneeling royal effigies of Louis XI in Notre-Dame-de-Cléry designed in 1474/1481 and Charles VIII's 1498 kneeling tomb in Saint-Denis, by the Italian sculptor Guido Mazzoni respectively.

Master Hanequin was in Toledo by 1442 and his brother Master Egas by 1454. Either Cueman brother might have seen French kneeling tombs if they travelled to Castile via France rather than taking a sea passage. Unless Egas joined his brother in Castile travelling overland through France in the late 1440s, neither of the brothers could actually have known the Jouvenel des Ursins tomb, though a contact of either artist or patron might have done. It is certainly possible that the Spanish kneeling effigies might have been connected with the emerging genre in France. There were other possible sources, however, more closely related to artistic convention.

In Spain the founders of family chapels might be commemorated as kneeling figures in wall paintings on the back wall behind the altar, one source of inspiration, perhaps.⁴⁴ Hugo van de Velde has suggested that the kneeling effigy was derived from the votive portrait offered in fulfilment of a vow, which might take the form of kneeling images placed in close proximity to a saint, shrine or sanctuary.⁴⁵ The kneeling figure of Antoine des Essart, chamberlain of Charles VI, is now known only from the Gaignières drawing and descriptions. His kneeling portrait statue was installed high up on a column in the nave of Notre Dame, Paris, overlooking a colossal figure of St Christopher which an inscription tells us he had commissioned in 1413.⁴⁶ St Christopher was the protector against sudden death of the sort that his brother had suffered when he was beheaded in the same year, so it is tempting to see this as a votive portrait.

More pertinently, kneeling subjects were also conventional in northern European commemorative stone reliefs, known as epitaphs. These were wall-mounted and usually accompanied a grave, though they could also commemorate a foundation.⁴⁷ They were produced in large numbers in the Burgundian Netherlands and beyond,

⁴² Nelson as at note 28, p.117.

⁴³ Wright as at anote 38, p.133

⁴⁴ As in the Calvillo chapel of Sts Peter and Paul in the church of Mary Magdalen in Tarazona ; see María Teresa Ainaga Andrés, 'El legado artístico de Pedro y Fernando Perez Calvillo a la sede episcopal de Tarazona (Zaragoza)', *Turiaso* X/2, 1992, pp.455-482 (p.470).

⁴⁵ Hugo van der Velden, *The donor's image*, Turnhout, Brepols, 2000, pp.237-8, 272-276.

⁴⁶ Adhemar as at note 39, no.1128 ; Jacques Antoine Dulaure, *Histoire physique, civile et morale de Paris depuis les temps historique*, vol I, Paris, Possy, 1859, p.344.

⁴⁷ For epitaphs, or more correctly wall-mounted memorials, see Douglas Brine, *Pious Memories: the Wall-Mounted Memorial in the Burgundian Netherlands*, Brill Studies in Netherlandish Art and Cultural History volume 13, Leiden, Brill, 2015.

and the Cueman brothers would have been very familiar with them. Many of these epitaphs were commissioned during the patron's lifetime, and so provided a surrogate presence before death as well after it, like the kneeling effigies of Barrientos and Velasco.⁴⁸ Some also have striking parallels in design: the votive relief of Thierry de la Hamaide (d.1415), lord of Condé, was probably commissioned before death and shows Thierry kneeling alone in prayer before a saintly abbot.⁴⁹ In comparison, it is as if the intensely illusionistic kneeling effigies of Pedro I, Barrientos and Velasco have stepped out of the confines of an epitaph to take their place as three dimensional surrogates within the chapel space itself, accompanying their graves and, in the case of Barrientos, also commemorating the foundation of theology teaching in the Capilla Mayor.

The same is true of the now heavily-restored stone statues of Jean, Duc de Berry (fig.7; d.1416) and his wife Jeanne d'Armagnac (d.1387), with which Chao Castro compared the Spanish effigies. Originally in the Sainte Chapelle in Bourges (built 1391-1405) these statues are sometimes attributed to the Franco Flemish sculptor Jean de Cambrai (d. 1438).⁵⁰ Placed to either side of the altar, close to the Duc's tomb, and gazing toward an alabaster image of Notre Dame la Blanche, these free-standing figures kneel on two cushions at a prie dieu and in attitudes of prayer.⁵¹ Placed close to the Duc's grave they constitute a kind of three-dimensional epitaph. Unlike Netherlandish epitaphs, which were usually carved in relief and hung on a wall, these statues are orientated towards an altar, which brings them closer to the Castilian kneeling effigies. These were evidently celebrated images by the time Holbein drew them on a trip to France in 1523-4, and may have been so much earlier.⁵² Jean Jouvenel I evidently knew Jean duc de Berry in Paris and was respected by him.⁵³ The Duc lent him a book in Latin containing several texts. It is certainly possible that the statues at Bourges constituted part of the inspiration for Jouvenel's tomb. Whether Spanish patrons might have known these statues, or whether northern artists like the Cueman brothers travelling by land through France to seek work in Spain might have had access to them is harder to establish, but not impossible.

For big or important projects, patrons sometimes sent their artists travelling, sometimes abroad, to see prestigious works of art that might serve as possible models. The wider continental experience of the Cueman brothers might conceivably have meant they could offer such intelligence without the necessity for further

⁴⁸ Brine makes the same point in relation to Van Eyck's wall mounted memorial for Canon van der Paele; Ibid., p.190.

⁴⁹ Now castle of Caudry ; see Ludovic Nys, *Les tableaux votifs tournaisiens en pierre 1350-1475*, Brussels, Académie royale de Belgique, 2001, pp.190-191, no.XV.

⁵⁰ Chao Castro as in note 2, p.117.

⁵¹ *La Sainte Chapelle de Bourges: une fondation disparue de Jean duc de France, duc de Berry* (exh.cat.), Musée du Berry, Bourges, 2004), pp. 70, 87, 118-9 ; 188-9, 192; Alain Erlande-Brandenburg, 'Jean de Cambrai, sculpteur de Jean de France Duc de Berry', *Monuments et mémoires*, 63, 1980, pp.143-186.

⁵² Fridtjof Zschokke, 'Die Zeichnungen Hans Holbein der Junge nach den Bildnisstatuen des Herzogs und der Herzogin von Berry in Bourges', *Zeitschrift für Schweizer Archäologie und Kunstgeschichte*, 18/4, 1958, p.181.

⁵³ Pierre Louis Péchenard, *Jean Juvenal des Ursins, Historien de Charles VI, Evêque de Beauvais et Laon, Archevêque-duc de Reims*, Paris, 1876, pp.56-57, 61.

travel, and this could well have included familiarity with kneeling images.⁵⁴ However the idea of a kneeling effigy evolved, the genre took root in the Iberian Peninsula because of the Cueman brothers from Brussels, and seems to have become a speciality of theirs. When Prior Gonzalo de Illescas (d.1464) commissioned his alabaster tomb from Egas Cueman at the remote monastery of Guadalupe in 1458, his emphatic insistence that the sculptor should follow both precise instructions and a pre-existing drawing may perhaps betray an anxiety not to end up with one of the new-fangled kneeling effigies like that of his acquaintance Barrientos.⁵⁵ Illescas could not of course have foreseen that it would be the kneeling format that would become the favourite royal choice in Habsburg Spain.

Fig.1

Egas Cueman, *Tomb of Alonso de Velasco* (d.1477) and his wife Isabel de Cuadros, commissioned 1467, finished after 1476, stone, Chapel of St Anne, pilgrimage church of Guadalupe.

Fig.2

Chapel of St Anne, pilgrimage church of Guadalupe

Fig.3

Hanequin and/or Egas Cueman, effigy of Lope de Barrientos, by 1454, alabaster, height 150cm. Museo de las Ferias, Medina del Campo. Photo © Fundación Museo de las Ferias, deposited by Fundación Simón Ruiz, Medina del Campo.

Fig.4

Egas Cueman, *Effigy of Pedro I*, after 1446, alabaster, 143.5 x 70 x 33cm. From San Domingo el Real, now Madrid, Archaeological Museum, Madrid © akg-images / Album / sfgp.

Fig.5

Effigies of Jean Jouvenel I and Michelle de Vitry, after 1443, stone, Chapel of Saint-Géry, Cathedral of Notre Dame, Paris © akg-images

Fig.6

Tomb of Jean Jouvenel I and Michelle de Vitry, Gaignières drawing 4301, Bibliothèque Nationale de France © Bibliothèque Nationale de France

Fig.7

Jean de Cambrai, Jean, duc de Berry, before 1416, stone, Cathedral of Saint-Étienne, Bourges © akg-images

⁵⁴ I am very grateful to Matt Kavalier for this point.

⁵⁵ Rubio & Acemel as at note 4, pp.199-201.